

# INTERNATIONAL CRITICAL REALISM CONFERENCE

OSLO UNIVERSITY COLLEGE, OSLO NORWAY

SEPTEMBER 5-7, 2011

ECOPHILOSOPHY AND CRITICAL REALISM

## TOWARDS A JUST SAFE WORLD

**ARUN G. MUKHOPADHYAY**

INDEPENDENT RESEARCHER, INDIA  
(FORMERLY OF INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT CALCUTTA)

arungm@gmail.com

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

# TOWARDS A JUST SAFE WORLD

---

## THE STRANGE NEW WORLD OF ANTHROPOCENE

The planet's environment had been unusually stable for the thousand years during the period geologically known as the Holocene. But since the Industrial Revolution, a new era, the Anthropocene has emerged, in which human activities push the Earth system beyond the stable environmental state which are potentially catastrophic for the planet. With everincreasing reliance on fossil fuels and industrialized agriculture, human activities have reached its zenith that could plunder the systems that kept Earth in the desirable Holocene state. The irreversible impacts bring about abrupt environmental changes, leading to a state detrimental to human and its nurturing mother earth. Reflexing Anthropocene global changes in a globalising world must take into account the transboundary flows of people, materials, fuel and pollution. These are precisely the processes that are undermining and plundering the biospheric system. Ecology has transcended conservationism to probe into changing modes of production and consumption and, inevitably in challenging an external nature (Dalby 2009).

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

## CARBON CAPITALISM AND ZERO-SUM WORLD SYSTEM

Conservative wisdom on sustainability and development is miserably uncritical about the distributive, political, and cultural dimensions of global environmental challenges. The sustainable development is a mere fantasy fundamentally because it does not recognize the entropic realities arising out of planetary dynamics. Reflexing environmental load displacement and ecologically unequal exchange- the forces behind global environmental 'zero-sum game' is essential to be acquainted with the extent to which 'cornucopian' kind of 'development' represent an illusion (Hornborg 2009). The origin of 'ecological debt' and 'ecologically unequal exchange' literature by the turn of the century can be traced back to world systems theory that explains why the peripheral and semi-peripheral nations are locked into ecologically unsustainable patterns. The debt encompasses the historical and modern exploitation of third world natural resources and the excessive use of 'environmental space' for dumping waste (e.g. expropriating global atmospheric resources). A grand coalition of environmental, human rights, and development advocacy groups have been urging the ecological debt to either be paid or used as balance in calculating national economic debts (Roberts and Parks, 2007). In his classic paper 'Development of Underdevelopment' (Frank 1966), Andre Gunder Frank observes that that economic development and underdevelopment are the opposite sides of the same coin and the product of the same historical process. In a subsequent complementary work, Frank(Frank 2001) elaborates on how the structure, process and transformation of the "single world-wide system," generate the new wealth and poverty of nations, based on and developed along two main conceptual red threads, entropy and multilateralism, that run almost parallel and intimately related as to intersect at important junctures. Entropy is dispersed from the more 'ordered' regions and sectors of the global world economy to other less 'ordered' regions that are obliged to absorb the entropy dissipated in their direction by the more 'ordered' ones. Thus the climate change caused by global warming and depletion of the ozone layer generated by industrialised nations' burning of coal and oil, mostly imported from less developed countries are ultimately (re)exported to second group, where they to sink low level areas into the rising sea, and massive destruction of virgin rain forests to maintain industries and consumption in developed world. The industrialised countries have polluted the environment to a catastrophic extent with increasing energy- and chemical-intensive production since the days of industrial revolution. Apart from

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

historic entropy transfer, the globalization has facilitated the developed countries to off-shore hazardous manufacturing in the underdeveloped South.

## DEVELOPMENT OF NECRODEVELOPMENT

The negative consequences of swelling civilian consumption and escalating military-industrial complexes by deploying ruthlessly limited resources stored in a finite and fragile planet. The resultant multiple social inequalities along with irreversible ecological consequences, threaten the sustainability of life-world as well as the planet itself (Jorgenson, Clark and Kentor 2010). The sociometabolic transition from an agrarian to an industrial regime is an ongoing process with important consequences for future global material and energy demand.

Classical economists had their vision of a 'stationary state'-the ontological destination of economic growth and development constrained by population exploration, finiteness of arable land and the exhaustibility of non-renewable resources. Classical economics treated land, labour and capital as the three factors of production. Neoclassical Economics has taken the necessary process of abstraction and thus excludes leaving essential aspects of the world out of the analysis. Vested interests from nineteenth century American railroad oligarchy to vanguards of Washington consensus have constructed and promoted a pseudoknowledge quixotically empowered to reign over academics and policy to perform its historic comprador role (Mukhopadhyay 2011). Technical progress seemed to offset any tendency towards diminishing returns. Land, like capital, could be effectively expanded, without limit, via land-augmenting technical progress, seemed to be the right thing to do. The economy subsystem expands relative to the fixed dimensions of the containing and sustaining ecosystem and becomes disembedded from the planetary socio-ecological threshold.

The neoliberal insights to overcome the burst phase of exploitation cycle looks towards hitherto unexplored, fragile and sensitive regions around the world like Polar Regions and sea-bed. Global biophysical transformation engenders localized stresses in the forms of coastal erosion, ice melt, and infertile land and deteriorating water sources. These stresses threaten critical

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

minimum basic needs of vulnerable societies without the capabilities of adaptation and resilience. Thus global warming is enhancing the fast liquefying of Arctic cryosphere, causes matching rise in sea-beds that will result in submerging of several small-island states in Pacific and Indian Ocean by the end of twenty-first century. Confronted with ecological crises, no attempt is made by the system to go to the root of the problem in the social relations."..... the technocrats promise to solve all problems while keeping the social relations intact"(York,Clark and Foster2009). The zero-sum game has its obvious tolls on wretched teeming millions mostly of 'other' world. The retarded societies become retarded ecologies too and the 'development of underdevelopment' diversifies with deadlier dimensions (Mukhopadhyay 2009). Because of these changes in global climate, areas like Arctic, Oceania, low coastal areas, and snowier regions are already undergoing significant climatic changes. These changes in climate not only create physical changes in specific locales, but also threaten critical minimum human security in specific environments. The Stern Review on the Economics of Climate Change (2007),sponsored by the Government of United Kingdom, estimates that the scale of migration will reach 200 million by 2050.

The genesis of the climate crisis is embedded in a much catastrophic ecological crisis –the ecological limits to economic growth. The eternal law of capitalist circulation -supply creates its own demand drives the expansion of production and consumption synergistically. This enterprise has all along reinforced the plunder of the planetary ecosystem that "is largely irreversible for 1,000 years after emission stops"(Solomons et.al.2009).

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

## VISUALISING A JUST SAFE WORLD

Reflecting contemporary global geopolitics in light of the changed perspectives in earth system requires recognition of embeddedness of both market and control and command economies and societies in the natural ecology, as visualised by Karl Polanyi by the historic turn of post-war world history. In his magnum opus 'The Great Transformation: The Political and Economic Origins of Our Time(1944),Polanyi emphasized that a total self-regulating market, disembedded from the society was nothing but a 'stark utopia'. Such an institution could not sustain 'without annihilating the human and natural substance of society...' Polanyi's relevance in contemporary geopolitics lies in his navigating the ontological shift towards examining the highly unequal world system vis-à-vis the pre-emptive belief in market and, inter alia, in technology as panacea. The neo-liberal project of globalisation, with its liberalisation of markets, privatisation, de-regulation and challenges to collective social agents, has increased the power of transnationally active capital enormously. The prevailing socio-ecological regime and its interconnected worldvision, institutions, and modus operandi all support the goal of unlimited growth of material production and consumption as the best possible quality of life. Transgressing one or more planetary boundaries may be deleterious or even catastrophic due to the risk of crossing thresholds that will trigger non-linear, abrupt environmental change within continental- to planetary-scale systems. It has been estimated that humanity has already transgressed three planetary boundaries: for climate change, rate of biodiversity loss, and changes to the global nitrogen cycle (Rockstrom et.al. 2009). Overcoming these roadblocks and creating a sustainable and desirable future will require a comprehensive and robust redesign of our socio-ecological regime supposed to pursue explicitly the goal of sustainable quality of life rather than the proxy of unlimited material growth.

Foucauldian wisdom reminds us if the values and political implications underlying the 'growth business as usual' do not ensure how to protect the society, we can refuse to accept their imperatives and develop alternative epistemology. It is a matter of de-colonizing the imagination and de-mystification of conceptions such as economic growth, progress, efficiency and GNP(Passadakis and Schmelzer 2010).A research-report" Limits to Growth", by an international team of experts assembled at the MIT Sloan

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

School of Management on a project supported by the Club of Rome was published as book in 1972(Meadows et.al. 1972). The main contribution of the 'Limits to Growth' was in attracting people's attention on the fact that the finite earth cannot sustain unlimited economic growth by continuous depletion of resources and the irreversible destruction of ecosystems. Since the mid 1980s, however, this 'limits to growth' position became largely marginalized, replaced by the currently dominant view that a 'de-coupling' of economic growth from negative environmental impacts can and will take place. Such a 'de-coupling' was emphasized by the World Commission on Environment and Development as a key strategy of sustainable development in their report 'Our Common Future (1987) pointed at eco-efficiency and dematerialization as the ways to make economic growth compatible with environmental sustainability.

## CRITICAL REALISM TO CONCRETE UTOPIA

In view of the barriers to capitalist sustainability, an alternative social narrative is needed- one that embraces values, understandings, and relationships that promote ecological stability and justice (Singer 2010).The goal in criticizing growth is to establish social rights globally, such that a good life is possible for all human beings and their future generations,as the vision of 'a just safe world' reflects.

Critical realism, a refinement over dialectical materialism, is a transdisciplinary approach; appreciates real but different structures and processes within the physical, biological and social spheres. At the surface level, we experience phenomena which arise out of the combination of objective powers with contingent factors and can be observed at a given temporal-spatial juncture (Huckle 2004). Critical realism regards nature as socially constructed as it is materially shaped by social practices and existentially produced as cultural discourses. Nature in the realist sense concurs with the phenomena of ecological limits to economic growth. It reflects on humans' relevant dilemma and alternatives in the context of ethics, politics and governance so that critical decisions on humans' relations with rest of human and non-human nature can be arrived at. Critical Realism criticizes the study of the social domain as a 'closed' system, as practiced in positivist approaches in the social sciences. Reality is the synergy among three interrelated levels; Realist explanation connects experience in the

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!



empirical domain like retreat of Arctic cryosphere and resultant south pacific sea-level rise to structures and processes in the real states of affairs like anthropogenic climate change through contingent structures and generative mechanisms like ever- increasing use of fossil fuels, failure of global governance to control the treadmills of production (and destruction) and carbon emission. Roy Bhaskar's reflections on transcendence towards concrete utopiasm "involves thinking how a situation or the world could be otherwise, with a change in the use of a given set of resources or with a different way of acting subject to certain constraints..... Radical intellectuals need to show in detail how alternative futures can be coherently grounded in the deep structures of what already exists, of what people already know and have. Without this exercise they will not be able to make out a persuasive case for change..... "(Bhaskar 2010).

Classical Marxists as well as liberals always regard utopia as unscientific. Critiquing their ideology and strategy are termed 'utopian' and their static and myopic world-views do not allow them to introspect about their disastrous/'mal'utopian visions in the context of a warming world. What is crucial is not the lack of trustworthiness in their 'visions', but their dominating attitude in ways in which they assert claim to their 'truth', through abstract rationalism, pragmatism or science (Firth 2010).Margaret Thatcher's famous assertion that 'there is no alternative'(TINA) and Francis Fukuyama's equally famous 'verdict' of 'End of History.....', though apparently seem to be quixotic utopias, are hegemonic/totalitarian utopias in reality. To secure and sustain neoliberal capitalist globalization, the speech act of a distinguished political personality and the 'amazing' narrative of a 'best-seller' trumpet the advent of a particular political and economic system as the final destination of humanity's sociocultural evolution. Political scientist-activist Susan George has countered TINA with the concrete utopia of TATA-'there are thousands of alternatives'.

## THE CREATIVE UTOPIA

In the early twentieth century, Indian poet-philosopher Rabindranath Tagore had preached for "lights emerging in the horizon of darkness"(anthokarer utso hote utsarita aalo) that would pave the desirable social transformation. The message has spiritual resemblance with the topology painted by Roy Bhaskar - creative journey from purely imaginary

pdfMachine

A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

utopias towards a concrete utopia. Bhaskar has illuminated his stance on the emancipatory transcendence by citing from early writings (1843) of Karl Marx- "The world has long since dreamed of something of which it needs only to become conscious for it to possess in reality"(Bhaskar 2010).

A radical school of ecosocialists have been pursuing their academic-activism to abolish alleged neoliberal barbarism. The International Ecosocialist Network's manifesto on climatic change, released during in the World Social Forum, Belem do Para, Brazil (January 2009) declared: "A global warming left without control will have devastating effects on humanity, the fauna and the flora. The yields of the harvest will fall drastically, bringing about famine on a large scale. Hundreds of millions of people will be de-placed by drought in some regions and by the rise of ocean level in others. A chaotic and unpredictable temperature will become the norm".

Obviously there is growing interest in practical side of eco-socialism-constructing alternatives to capitalism by envisaging production for social needs rather than for profit through consumerism. These diverse alternatives together form a social economy of alternative spaces within capitalism. But the transgressive potential of such 'transitional forms' could perhaps be limited and ultimately become a force for the status quo (Pepper 2010). The German 'greens', for example, emerged in 1980s with anti-systematic radical alternatives became, within a short period of time, the partner of ruling elites in managing and correcting the system. Their initial anti-military pacifist world-view underwent a U-turn when the German greens supported bombing of Kosovo in 1999(Vivas 2011).The radical green politics would be deviated from its historical role if it is trapped in its reformist / transitory mode and becomes myopic in visualizing 'a just safe world' by challenging the ideological vanguards of wealth and technology.

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

The western discourses on climate change degrowth, ecosocialism, etc., based on an analysis of energy, entropy and economics, and their social and cultural dimensions can learn from down-to-earth indigenous movements. The journey towards the 'just safe world'-the 'creative utopia' has taken off in a humble but steady way in 'other' America. The historic Latin American indigenous movements for 'Mother Earth's rights could ably convince their progressive polity to implement what is critical for the contemporary warming world. It became possible to insert ecosocialist and degrowth like concepts into the formal constitutions of the Bolivian and Ecuadorian states. This climax of world history has initiated the transcendence of the concrete utopianism to materialize as the creative utopianism of the imaginary: 'a just safe world'. The new statist left of South America convened The "Peoples World Conference on Climate Change and Mother Earth's Rights" held in Cochabamba, Bolivia from April 19-22, 2010 and the Fourth Americas Social Forum in Asuncion, Paraguay from August 11-15, 2010 have to envisage path towards 'a just safe world' - the good life (buen vivir) in an egalitarian society without materialistic growth marking a great leap beyond anti-utopian orthodoxy and neoliberal hegemony. The Conference was attended by thousands of people coming from all over the world including a large number of US citizens...Inaugurating the conference, Bolivian President Evo Morales described how the indigenous people's incessant bondage with nature since antiquity have evolved the metaphor of mother earth' as the prime mover of being part of the earth and envisioning an alternative model of human development abandoning the catastrophic capitalist dictates of 'supply creates its own demand'. The "Peoples Agreement" that was the outcome of Cochabamba people's conference opens with a statement of the severity and global imperative presented by climate change.

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

The genesis of the Cochabamba initiative has been the reversal in United States-Bolivian relations since Morales was elected President of Bolivia in 2005. The country has long been subjected to aggressive US intervention, supported by the country's comprador capitalists. Bolivia shook off these aggressive intrusions and has now taken the initiative, rallying international forces against US sabotage of climate justice and world peace. Bolivia broke with US drug war policies and protected coca cultivation in family farms. Bolivia cancelled the practice by which the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank had controls over Bolivia's financial policies, and ended its dependency on loans from these agencies. Bolivia's most effective challenge of North American hegemony has been through steps toward regional integration, a strive for alternative economic relationships on the basis of solidarity to bring forth a coordinated political bloc of concerned countries' resistance to U.S.-led imperialism. Ambassador Pablo Solon of the Plurinational State of Bolivia addressed reporters at the UN climate talks in Bonn, Germany on June 16 2011. He outlined a clear plan, on how to move the talks forward in 2011. Ambassador Solon vehemently declared what is attuned to the tenets of creative utopianism: "We believe the issue is much bigger than just commitments and targets, and that those considering human rights breaches are correct..... We have been advocating for an international court of climate justice. This would monitor the impacts and the suffering not only of people but of mother earth because of climate change. For the glaciers in the andes, desertification in Africa, disappearing small island states - they need to present demands and find justice and we are proposing it to these talks under work going forward."

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

Bhaskar Roy 2010- Contexts of Interdisciplinarity, in Interdisciplinarity and Climate Change,Eds.Roy Bhaskar et.al.,Routledge 2010

Frank Andre Gunder 2001-Location, Location, Location to Dissipate And Absorb Entropy, paper presented at International Studies Association, Chicago Annual Meetings,February20-24,2001

Frank Andre Gunder 1966- Development of Underdevelopment, Monthly Review, vol.18, No.4, September.

Firth Rhiannon 2010-Critical Utopian Citizenship: Theory and Practice, Unpublished PhD thesis submitted to the University of Nottingham, July 2010

Hornborg Alf 2009-Zero-Sum World-Challenges in conceptualizing Environmental Load Displacement and Ecologically Unequal Exchange in World System, International Journal of Comparative Sociology, vol.50(3-4),237-262.

Huckle John 2004-'Critical Realism: A Philosophical Framework for Higher Education for Sustainability', Chapter 4 in Higher Education and the Challenge of Sustainability, P. Corcoran & A. Wals (Eds.), Kluwer, 2004, pp. 33 – 46

Jorgenson Andrew K, Clark Brett and Kentor Jeffrey 2010-Militarization and the Environment: A Panel Study of Carbon Dioxide Emissions and the Ecological Footprints of Nations, 1970–2000,Global Environmental Politic,.Vol.10.No.1,February 2010, 7-29

Meadows Donella H,Meadows Dennis L, Randers Jorgen and Behrens II William W 1972-The Limits To Growth, Universal Books

Moylan, T. (1986). Demand the Impossible: Science fiction and the utopian imagination. New York: Methuen

Mukhopadhyay Arun G. 2011-Neoclassical Economics: Pseudoknowledge and Necropower, Submitted for publication

Mukhopadhyay Arun G. 2009- Critical Climatics, Forced Migration and Social Justice (August 4, 2009). Available at ;SSRN:http://ssrn.com/abstract=1443769

pdfMachine

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!

Passadakis Alexis J. and Schmelzer Matthias 2010-12 lines of flight for just degrowth Decroissance/Degrowth/Decrescita/Postwachstum, July 2010

Pepper David 2010-On Contemporary Eco-socialism, in Eco-socialism as Politics-Rebuilding the Basis of our Modern Civilisation, Huan Quingzhi(Ed.) Springer 2010

Roberts J. Timmons and Parks Bradley C. 2009- Ecologically Unequal Exchange, Ecological Debt, and Climate Justice, International Journal of Comparative Sociology, vol.50(3-4), 381-408

Rockström, J., W. Steffen, K. Noone, Å. Persson, F. S. Chapin, III, E. Lambin, T. M. Lenton, M. Scheffer, C. Folke, H. Schellnhuber, B. Nykvist, C. A. De Wit, T. Hughes, S. van der Leeuw, H. Rodhe, S. Sörlin, P.K. Snyder, R. Costanza, U. Svedin, M. Falkenmark, L. Karlberg, R. W. Corell, V. J. Fabry, J. Hansen, B. Walker, D. Liverman, K. Richardson, P. Crutzen, and J. Foley. 2009- Planetary boundaries: exploring the safe operating space for humanity. Ecology and Society 14(2): 32.

Singer Merrill 2010-Eco-nomics: Are the Planet-Unfriendly Features of Capitalism Barriers to Sustainability? Sustainability 2010, 2, 127-144

Solomon S, Plattner G, Knutti R and Friedlingston P 2009- Irreversible Climate Change Due To carbon dioxide emissions, PNAS 106(6) 1704-1709

Vivas Esther 2011-Anticapitalism and Environmentalism as a political Alternative, International Viewpoint August 2011

**pdfMachine**

**A pdf writer that produces quality PDF files with ease!**

Produce quality PDF files in seconds and preserve the integrity of your original documents. Compatible across nearly all Windows platforms, simply open the document you want to convert, click "print", select the "Broadgun pdfMachine printer" and that's it! Get yours now!